New and Updated Ratings

View the complete list of currently published recommendations

Finalization Session: February 8, 2023, Release Date: March 6, 2023

New Ratings

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Rating	Justification
Anchovy, European	*Engraulis encrasicolus*	France - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - North (Division 27.8.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European anchovy caught by French fisheries in the northern Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Other Species** and **Management** ratings. European anchovy isn't depleted, but it's unknown if overfishing is occurring. This fishery also catches European pilchard, and it's likely depleted and experiencing overfishing. Management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of pilchard. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Anchovy, European	*Engraulis encrasicolus*	Portugal and Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Portuguese Waters - East (Division 27.9.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European anchovy caught by Portuguese or Spanish fisheries in Portugal's Atlantic waters with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species**, **Management**, and **Habitat & Ecosystem** ratings. The Iberian Coast European stock has two separate components, and at least one is depleted, and it's unknown if overfishing is occurring. This fishery also catches European pilchard, and it's uncertain if fishing levels are sustainable for this key forage species. Management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of anchovy. Also, the pilchard harvest has regularly exceeded scientific advice in recent years, and the current catch limits are not precautionary enough to protect its important ecosystem role. Purse seines have minimal to no seafloor impacts.
Anchovy, European	*Engraulis encrasicolus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - Central (Division 27.8.b)	Purse seines	**Best Choice**	European anchovy caught by Spanish fisheries in the central Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated a Best Choice due to green ratings for **all criteria**. European anchovy isn't depleted in the Bay of Biscay, but it's unknown if overfishing is occurring. In addition, management is rated effective overall because there are appropriate measures to ensure fishing levels for European anchovy are sustainable. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Anchovy, European	*Engraulis encrasicolus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - South (Division 27.8.c)	Purse seines	**Best Choice**	European anchovy caught by Spanish fisheries in the southern Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated a Best Choice due to green ratings for **all criteria**. European anchovy isn't depleted in the Bay of Biscay, but it's unknown if overfishing is occurring. In addition, management is rated effective overall because there are appropriate measures to ensure fishing levels for European anchovy are sustainable. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Rating	Justification
Mackerel, Atlantic	*Scomber scombrus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - South (Division 27.8.c)	Handlines and hand-operated pole-and-lines	**Avoid**	Atlantic mackerel caught by Spanish fisheries in the southern Bay of Biscay with handlines and hand-operated pole-and-lines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species** and **Management** ratings. Atlantic mackerel in the Bay of Biscay are part of a larger population covering the whole Northeast Atlantic, and that population is experiencing overfishing. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of Atlantic mackerel. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Mackerel, Atlantic	*Scomber scombrus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - South (Division 27.8.c)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	Atlantic mackerel caught by Spanish fisheries in the southern Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species** and **Management** ratings. Atlantic mackerel in the Bay of Biscay are part of a larger population covering the whole Northeast Atlantic, and that population is experiencing overfishing. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of Atlantic mackerel. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Mackerel, Atlantic Chub	*Scomber colias*	Portugal and Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Portuguese Waters - East (Division 27.9.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	Atlantic chub mackerel caught by Portuguese or Spanish fisheries in Portugal's Atlantic waters with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Other Species**, **Management**, and **Habitat & Ecosystem** ratings. Atlantic chub mackerel hasn't been assessed, so the stock's status and likelihood of overfishing are unknown. This fishery also catches European anchovy, and the southern part of the stock is depleted. European pilchard is caught too, and it's uncertain if fishing levels are sustainable for this key forage species. Management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of anchovy. Also, the pilchard harvest has regularly exceeded scientific advice in recent years, and the current catch limits are not precautionary enough to protect its important ecosystem role. Purse seines have minimal to no seafloor impacts.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Rating	Justification
Mackerel, European Horse	*Trachurus trachurus*	Portugal and Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Portuguese Waters - East (Division 27.9.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European horse mackerel caught by Portuguese or Spanish fisheries in Portugal's Atlantic waters with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Other Species**, **Management**, and **Habitat & Ecosystem** ratings. European horse mackerel isn't depleted or experiencing overfishing in Portugal's Atlantic waters. This fishery also catches European anchovy, and the southern part of the stock is depleted. European pilchard is caught too, and it's uncertain if fishing levels are sustainable for this key forage species. Management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of anchovy. Also, the pilchard harvest has regularly exceeded scientific advice in recent years, and the current catch limits are not precautionary enough to protect its important ecosystem role. Purse seines have minimal to no seafloor impacts.
Sardine, European Pilchard	*Sardina pilchardus*	France - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - Central (Division 27.8.b)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European pilchard caught by French fisheries in the central Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species** and **Management** ratings. European pilchard is likely depleted and experiencing overfishing. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of pilchard. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Sardine, European Pilchard	*Sardina pilchardus*	France - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - North (Division 27.8.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European pilchard caught by French fisheries in the northern Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species** and **Management** ratings. European pilchard is likely depleted and experiencing overfishing. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of pilchard. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Sardine, European Pilchard	*Sardina pilchardus*	Portugal and Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Portuguese Waters - East (Division 27.9.a)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European pilchard caught by Portuguese or Spanish fisheries in Portugal's Atlantic waters with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Other Species**, **Management**, and **Habitat & Ecosystem** ratings. European pilchard is a key forage fish in Portugal's Atlantic waters, and it's uncertain if fishing levels are sustainable. This fishery also catches European anchovy, and the southern part of the stock is depleted. Management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of anchovy. Also, the pilchard harvest has regularly exceeded scientific advice in recent years, and the current catch limits are not precautionary enough to protect its important ecosystem role. Purse seines have minimal to no seafloor impacts.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Rating	Justification
Sardine, European Pilchard	*Sardina pilchardus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - Central (Division 27.8.b)	Purse seines	**Avoid**	European pilchard caught by Spanish fisheries in the central Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated Avoid due to red **Target Species** and **Management** ratings. European pilchard is likely depleted and experiencing overfishing. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because the current measures haven't prevented the overfishing of pilchard. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Sardine, European Pilchard	*Sardina pilchardus*	Spain - Northeast Atlantic Ocean: Bay of Biscay - South (Division 27.8.c)	Purse seines	**Good Alternative**	European pilchard caught by Spanish fisheries in the southern Bay of Biscay with purse seines is rated a Good Alternative due to red **Management**, yellow **Target Species**, and green **Other Species** and **Habitat & Ecosystem** ratings. European pilchard's stock status in the southern Bay of Biscay is uncertain. In addition, management is rated ineffective overall because there are no catch limits for pilchard, and the amount harvested has exceeded scientific advice for years. Bycatch and seafloor impacts are minimal, but stronger measures to protect the ecosystem are needed.
Tilapia, Hybrid Red	*Oreochromis mossambicus x Oreochromis niloticus*	Colombia	Ponds	**Good Alternative**	Hybrid red tilapia farmed in Colombia in ponds is rated a Good Alternative due to yellow ratings for **all criteria** except a green **Source of Stock** rating. Several criteria rated as moderate concerns partly reflect the limited data from the tens of thousands of (mostly small-scale) pond farms in Colombia. For example, there are limited data on effluent (farm waste) impacts, and the frequency and scale of chemical use are essentially unknown, particularly on small farms. Specific data on the composition of tilapia feeds are limited, but the use of marine-based ingredients is understood to be low and sourced from moderately sustainable fisheries. There are few data about escapes, though tilapia is now widely established in Colombia, partly due to stocking efforts by the government. Even though there are regulations to protect the wildlife that may prey on farmed tilapia, there are few data to understand how many wildlife mortalities are occurring. The movements of tilapia fingerlings (young tilapia) from hatcheries to farms in Colombia may also pose a risk of introducing secondary species into new waterbodies. Finally, many small tilapia pond farms are not yet formally registered with the government. Therefore, understanding the application and enforcement of the regulatory system (for example, for effluent permits or environmental impact assessments) is challenging.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Rating	Justification
Tilapia, Nile	*Oreochromis niloticus*	Colombia	Ponds	**Good Alternative**	Nile tilapia farmed in Colombia in ponds is rated a Good Alternative due to yellow ratings for **all criteria** except a green **Source of Stock** rating. Several criteria rated as moderate concerns partly reflect the limited data from the tens of thousands of (mostly small-scale) pond farms in Colombia. For example, there are limited data on effluent (farm waste) impacts, and the frequency and scale of chemical use are essentially unknown, particularly on small farms. Specific data on the composition of tilapia feeds are limited, but the use of marine-based ingredients is understood to be low and sourced from moderately sustainable fisheries. There are few data about escapes, though tilapia is now widely established in Colombia, partly due to stocking efforts by the government. Even though there are regulations to protect the wildlife that may prey on farmed tilapia, there are few data to understand how many wildlife mortalities are occurring. The movements of tilapia fingerlings (young tilapia) from hatcheries to farms in Colombia may also pose a risk of introducing secondary species into new waterbodies. Finally, many small tilapia pond farms are not yet formally registered with the government. Therefore, understanding the application and enforcement of the regulatory system (for example, for effluent permits or environmental impact assessments) is challenging.

Updated Ratings

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Previous Rating	Updated Rating	Justification
Drum, Red	*Sciaenops ocellatus*	United States	Ponds	**Best Choice**	**Best Choice**	Red drum farmed in the U.S. in ponds remains a Best Choice due to yellow **Habitat**, **Feed**, and **Disease** ratings and green ratings for **all other criteria**. Today, habitat regulations are robust and enforced well, and red drum farms are primarily sited on previously converted shrimp farms or agricultural land. The feed's marine-based ingredients are mainly sourced from sustainable fisheries, but their inclusion has increased over the last five years. In addition, it takes approximately two metric tons of wild fish to produce one metric ton of red drum. Also, there's a risk of disease spreading to the surrounding environment, but the disease incidence among the farmed fish is reportedly low, and health and biosecurity measures are strong. All other environmental impacts (or the risk of impacts) are rated low concerns.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Previous Rating	Updated Rating	Justification
Mullet, Red	*Mullus surmuletus*	United Kingdom - Cornwall, Northeast Atlantic Ocean	Beam trawls	**Good Alternative**	**Avoid**	Red mullet caught in Cornwall, U.K., with beam trawls has been downgraded to an Avoid rating due to a red **Other Species** rating and yellow ratings for **all other criteria**. The stock's status is unknown in this location. In addition, the catch of Atlantic cod, sharks, and other overexploited species is a serious concern. Management is rated moderately effective overall because the strategies to prevent the overfishing of red mullet and other landed species need strengthening. Also, efforts to reduce bycatch are being made, but their effectiveness is uncertain. Seafloor impacts are more significant when red mullet is caught with trawls (compared to set gillnets), and few measures are in place to mitigate the impacts to bottom-dwelling species and habitats. Ecosystem-based management is being developed, and these fisheries are unlikely to harm the food web. (Note: The trawl and set gillnet fisheries have yellow Habitat & Ecosystem ratings, but the lower numerical score for the trawl fisheries follows the Seafood Watch standard for trawls operating on sandy substrates and is factored in the overall Avoid rating for these fisheries.)

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Previous Rating	Updated Rating	Justification
Mullet, Red	*Mullus surmuletus*	United Kingdom - Cornwall, Northeast Atlantic Ocean	Bottom trawls	**Good Alternative**	**Avoid**	Red mullet caught in Cornwall, U.K., with bottom trawls has been downgraded to an Avoid rating due to a red **Other Species** rating and yellow ratings for **all other criteria**. The stock's status is unknown in this location. In addition, the catch of Atlantic cod, sharks, and other overexploited species is a serious concern. Management is rated moderately effective overall because the strategies to prevent the overfishing of red mullet and other landed species need strengthening. Also, efforts to reduce bycatch are being made, but their effectiveness is uncertain. Seafloor impacts are more significant when red mullet is caught with trawls (compared to set gillnets), and few measures are in place to mitigate the impacts to bottom-dwelling species and habitats. Ecosystem-based management is being developed, and these fisheries are unlikely to harm the food web. (Note: The trawl and set gillnet fisheries have yellow Habitat & Ecosystem ratings, but the lower numerical score for the trawl fisheries follows the Seafood Watch standard for trawls operating on sandy substrates and is factored in the overall Avoid rating for these fisheries.)
Mullet, Red	*Mullus surmuletus*	United Kingdom - Cornwall, Northeast Atlantic Ocean	Set gillnets	**Good Alternative**	**Good Alternative**	Red mullet caught in Cornwall, U.K., with set gillnets remains a Good Alternative due to a red **Other Species** rating and yellow ratings for **all other criteria**. The stock's status is unknown in this location. In addition, the catch of European mackerel and other overexploited species and the risk of marine mammal entanglements in gillnet fishing gear are serious concerns. Management is rated moderately effective overall because the strategies to prevent the overfishing of red mullet and other landed species need strengthening. Also, efforts to reduce bycatch are being made, but their effectiveness is uncertain. The set gillnet fishery has minimal seafloor habitats compared to the trawl fisheries that catch red mullet. Ecosystem-based management is being developed, and these fisheries are unlikely to harm the food web.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Previous Rating	Updated Rating	Justification
Tilapia, Hybrid Red	*Oreochromis mossambicus x Oreochromis niloticus*	Colombia	Net pens	**Good Alternative**	**Good Alternative**	Hybrid red tilapia farmed in Colombia in net pens remains a Good Alternative due to yellow ratings for **all criteria** except **green Habitat** and **Source of Stock** ratings. Tilapia produced in net pens occurs almost exclusively in the Betania Reservoir. While data availability has improved, several criteria rated as moderate concerns partly reflect a limited understanding of the potential impacts in this artificial waterbody. Effluent (farm waste) has impacted the water quality (along with other sources like agriculture) and contributed to fish mortalities in the reservoir. However, effluent doesn't appear to affect water quality in rivers beyond the reservoir. While some farms can be shown to avoid chemical use, the overall frequency and scale of chemical use are largely unknown. Specific data on the composition of tilapia feeds are limited, but the use of marine-based ingredients is understood to be low and sourced from moderately sustainable fisheries. There are few data about escapes, though tilapia is now widely established in Colombia, partly due to stocking efforts by the government. Even though there are regulations to protect the wildlife that may prey on farmed tilapia, there are few data to understand how many wildlife mortalities are occurring. Due to the single location in Betania Reservoir, the government's regulatory control of the industry is considered robust, but there are few details or data available relating to monitoring and/or enforcement measures. Lastly, the introduction of zooplankton species into the Betania Reservoir demonstrates the ongoing risk of unintentionally introducing non-native species when tilapia fingerlings (young tilapia) are transported from hatcheries to farms in Colombia.

Species	Scientific Name	Location	Method	Previous Rating	Updated Rating	Justification
Tilapia, Nile	*Oreochromis niloticus*	Colombia	Net pens	**Good Alternative**	**Good Alternative**	Nile tilapia farmed in Colombia in net pens remains a Good Alternative due to yellow ratings for **all criteria** except green **Habitat** and **Source of Stock** ratings. Tilapia produced in net pens occurs almost exclusively in the Betania Reservoir. While data availability has improved, several criteria rated as moderate concerns partly reflect a limited understanding of the potential impacts in this artificial waterbody. Effluent (farm waste) has impacted the water quality (along with other sources like agriculture) and contributed to fish mortalities in the reservoir. However, effluent doesn't appear to affect water quality in rivers beyond the reservoir. While some farms can be shown to avoid chemical use, the overall frequency and scale of chemical use are largely unknown. Specific data on the composition of tilapia feeds are limited, but the use of marine-based ingredients is understood to be low and sourced from moderately sustainable fisheries. There are few data about escapes, though tilapia is now widely established in Colombia, partly due to stocking efforts by the government. Even though there are regulations to protect the wildlife that may prey on farmed tilapia, there are few data to understand how many wildlife mortalities are occurring. Due to the single location in Betania Reservoir, the government's regulatory control of the industry is considered robust, but there are few details or data available relating to monitoring and/or enforcement measures. Lastly, the introduction of zooplankton species into the Betania Reservoir demonstrates the ongoing risk of unintentionally introducing non-native species when tilapia fingerlings (young tilapia) are transported from hatcheries to farms in Colombia.